



The City of Seattle

International Special Review District

Mailing Address: PO Box 94649 Seattle WA 98124-4649
Street Address: 700 5th Ave Suite 1700

ISRD 155/07

MINUTES FOR THE MEETING OF TUESDAY, July 24, 2007

Time: 4:30 p.m.
Place: Bush Asia Center
409 Maynard Avenue S.
Basement conference room

Board Members Present

Jerry Chihara
Jan Johnson
Freeman Fong
Hoa Tang
Amalia Gonzalez-Kahn
Dr. Austen Chan
Robert Ha

Staff

Rebecca Frestedt

Ms. Johnson called to order at 4:40pm

072407.1 APPROVAL OF MINUTES June 26, 2007 and July 10, 2007

Moved to approve the minutes from June 26, 2007, as corrected.
MM/SC/JC/HT 2:0:2 Minutes adopted.
(Ms. Gonzalez-Kahn and Ms. Johnson abstained.)

Moved to approve the minutes from July 10, 2007, as presented.
MM/SC/AGK/JC 4:0:0 Minutes adopted.

072407.2 CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

072407.21 Mar Hotel Building
507 Maynard Ave. S.

Application: Exterior alterations – The applicant proposes to replace the existing wooden window units on the alley façade with new vinyl frames and sashes.

Staff Report: Ms. Frestedt gave the staff report. She said that the International Special Review District Board recommended renewal of a Certificate of Approval for Use and Final

Design for the Mar and Alps Hotels on July 10, 2007. The renewal included approval to repair and replace the building's wooden windows. She said that a 2002 window survey, conducted by Les Tonkin, recommended repair of the existing original materials; however, an updated survey revealed that the condition of the window jambs, sills and heads has deteriorated. Based on the updated survey, the applicant is requesting to replace the entire window with new vinyl double or single hung frames.

[Dr. Chan arrived at 4:45 PM. Messrs. Ha and Fong arrived at 4:48 PM.]

Ms. Frestedt stated that the Board had approved vinyl windows as part of the new construction of the penthouse, but that consideration of vinyl windows on historic buildings is typically discouraged. She added that the windows in question are located on a secondary elevation facing the alley and that the windows are not visible from the street. The Mar Hotel contributes to the National Register and is located within the historic core of the District.

Applicant Comment: Randy Sibley, project manager for the Mar and Alps Hotel renovations, presented the application. James and Chris Koh, building owners, were also seated at the table. Mr. Sibley restated that the window replacement will be on the alley façade on floors 2-4. He added that the Board approved vinyl windows in the interior courtyard on floors 3 and 4. They are proposing to replace a total of thirty-three total windows, eleven on each floor.

Mr. Chihara asked if the light wells are new or existing and if the windows in the light wells are new. Mr. Sibley responded that they are existing light wells and the windows were original.

Mr. Fong asked if the light wells are only visible from the second floor or if you can see them from the elevator. Mr. Sibley said that you could see the windows in the courtyard from the hallway inside the building.

Mr. Fong asked if the change in going to vinyl is primarily a cost consideration. Mr. Sibley said that the decision is based on cost and maintenance, such as the need to repaint wooden windows.

Mr. Sibley said the vinyl windows would be installed in the same position of the original wood windows and have the same wood trim on the outside.

There was a discussion about the removal of the building's previous canopy. Mr. Fong stated that since the canopy was removed, the building lost some of its character within the District. He stated that the Board has allowed changes that have diminished the character of the building.

Ms. Frestedt told the Board about a conversation she had with Les Tonkin regarding his revised survey. She reported that Mr. Tonkin discussed alternatives with the applicants, including aluminum frames with wood cladding or all new wooden frames. He said that he included vinyl windows in his report because of the location and the fact that it would be difficult for passersby to see from the alley.

Mr. Chris Koh said that the other windows inside the courtyard would be Pella vinyl windows, which would match the proposed alley windows. He also commented on energy efficiency and functionality.

Ms. Johnson said that a better option may be aluminum frame, wood clad windows, in terms of the context and make up of the neighborhood. She emphasized the character defining importance of windows within the District. Mr. Fong agreed that it would be better to see the original materials.

Mr. Sibley said that when you look at the window, you would see the frame and the trim around it; therefore, very little of the vinyl would be exposed. He stated that using vinyl windows with wood trim would not significantly change the experience of looking at the window from the exterior.

Ms. Johnson asked if the windows will open. Mr. Sibley said that they would.

Ms. Gonzalez-Kahn stated that she agrees that historic elements of the building have gradually been going away and that by approving vinyl windows the Board continues to slowly chip away. She would like to see a material that is more true to the historic design of the building. She added that she would encourage the applicants to put the canopy back on, as well.

Mr. Sibley said that they intend to keep the windows white. Ms. Johnson commented that she thought they were formerly cream colored. This led to a discussion about manufacturers and color availability.

Mr. Chihara stated that there is an argument to be made for the fact that the window is on the secondary façade. He said that he places weight in letter submitted by Les Tonkin; however, he agrees with Mr. Fong and Ms. Gonzalez-Kahn about the loss of integrity.

Mr. Fong restated his interest in the applicants making other improvements to the front of the building. There was then a lengthy discussion about retaining integrity throughout the District.

Ms. Frestedt reminded the Board that they could only make a determination on the current application, for the alley side windows.

Ms. Gonzalez-Kahn asked how much visual difference there is between wood on the storefronts, as opposed to aluminum or other materials.

Mr. Sibley responded that is a notable difference. Mr. Chihara described how the glass is set differently within different window frame materials. He said that the glass in aluminum frames would be set flush with the materials; whereas, wooden frames the glass is set back which creates more depth and shadowing.

Public Comment: There was no public comment

Board discussion:

Mr. Tang stated that the Board should protect the whole building and not make exceptions to do something different in the back. Ms. Johnson agreed.

Ms. Gonzalez-Kahn said if she were to vote today, she would only support wood replacement for the windows. Dr. Chan also stated that he would not support vinyl windows.

Discussion about the complexity of the application ensued.

Ms. Frestedt advised the Board that they could ask for additional information or vote on the application based on the information provided. Mr. Sibley asked if they could withdraw the application and come back with a revised proposal. Ms. Frestedt responded that a decision to withdraw the application is the prerogative of the applicants.

Ms. Johnson asked the applicants if their application was still active.

Mr. Sibley said no, that they will withdraw the application for vinyl windows. He said they will return to the ISRD with a new proposal. Ms. Frestedt recommended that the applicants include alternatives in a future application.

Action: The application was withdrawn by the applicants. There Board did not take action on the application.

072407.3

BOARD BUSINESS

There was no Board business.

ADJOURN Moved to adjourn at 6:10pm

Issued: August 13, 2007

Rebecca Frestedt, Board Coordinator
206-684-0226
rebecca.frestedt@seattle.gov